

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

JOSE ARELLANO-CIGFUEGO,
Petitioner,
v.
WARDEN,
Respondent.

Case No. 1:23-cv-01351-WBS-SAB-HC

**FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION
RECOMMENDING RESPONDENT'S
MOTION TO DISMISS BE GRANTED AND
PETITION FOR WRIT OF HABEAS
CORPUS BE DISMISSED**

(ECF No. 17)

Petitioner is a federal prisoner proceeding pro se with a petition for writ of habeas corpus pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 2241.

I.

BACKGROUND

In the instant petition for writ of habeas corpus, Petitioner challenges a Federal Bureau of Prisons' policy (Program Statement 5410.01), alleging that the policy excludes inmates with immigration detainees, such as Petitioner, from applying their First Step Act ("FSA") Earned Time Credits ("FTCs" or "ETCs"). (ECF No. 1 at 6.¹) On October 17, 2023, the Court ordered Petitioner to show cause why the petition should not be dismissed for failure to exhaust administrative remedies. (ECF No. 6.) As Petitioner did not file a response to the order to show cause, the Court issued findings and recommendation to dismiss the petition for failure to

¹ Page numbers refer to the ECF page numbers stamped at the top of the page.

1 exhaust administrative remedies. (ECF No. 8.) Petitioner filed timely objections, and the Court
2 vacated the findings and recommendation. (ECF Nos. 9, 13.)

3 On May 30, 2024, Respondent filed a motion to dismiss the petition on the following
4 grounds: (1) lack of constitutional standing and failure to state a claim because Petitioner is the
5 subject of a final order of removal; and (2) the lack of “statutory authority under § 2241 to
6 compel BOP’s FSA ETC discretionary (sentence end-phase programming) action via declaratory
7 and advisory opinions.” (ECF No. 17 at 3.) On July 10, 2024, the Court ordered Respondent to
8 file a copy of Petitioner’s purported final order of removal. (ECF No. 18.) On July 24, 2024, the
9 final order of removal was filed under seal. (ECF No. 23.) To date, neither an opposition to the
10 motion to dismiss nor a response to the purported final order of removal has been filed, and the
11 time for doing so has passed.

12 **II.**

13 **DISCUSSION**

14 **A. First Step Act and Earned Time Credits**

15 “On December 21, 2018, the First Step Act of 2018, Pub. L. No. 115-391, 132 Stat. 5194,
16 was enacted. The Act implemented a number of prison and sentencing reforms.” Bottinelli v.
17 Salazar, 929 F.3d 1196, 1197 (9th Cir. 2019). With respect to earned time credit, the Ninth
18 Circuit has described the First Step Act’s amendments as follows:

19 [P]aragraph 102(b)(1) amends [18 U.S.C.] § 3624 by adding subsection (g),
20 which is relevant to the Act’s creation of an earned time credit system.² [132
21 Stat.] at 5210-13. The Act requires that, within 210 days of its enactment, the
22 Attorney General establish a “risk and needs assessment system” to, broadly
23 speaking, review each prisoner’s recidivism risk level, award earned time credit
24 as an incentive for participation in recidivism reduction programming, and
“determine when a prisoner is ready to transfer into prerelease custody or
supervised release in accordance with section 3624.” § 101(a), 132 Stat. at 5196–
97. Section 3624(g) details the criteria for when a prisoner becomes eligible,
considering earned time credit, for transfer to prerelease custody or supervised
release. § 102(b), 132 Stat. at 5210–13.

25 Bottinelli, 929 F.3d at 1197–98 (footnote in original).

26 ///

27 _____
28 ² In contrast to good time credit, earned time credit is awarded for “successfully complet[ing] evidence-based
recidivism reduction programming or productive activities.” § 101(a), 132 Stat. at 5198.

1 Section 3632(d)(4)(A) provides that “[a] prisoner, except for an ineligible prisoner under
2 subparagraph (D), who successfully completes evidence-based recidivism reduction
3 programming or productive activities, shall earn time credits[.]” 18 U.S.C. § 3632(d)(4)(A).
4 “Time credits earned under this paragraph by prisoners who successfully participate in
5 recidivism reduction programs or productive activities shall be applied toward time in prerelease
6 custody or supervised release. The Director of the Bureau of Prisons shall transfer eligible
7 prisoners, as determined under section 3624(g), into prerelease custody or supervised release.”
8 18 U.S.C. § 3632(d)(4)(C).

9 However, subparagraph (E) provides:

10 **(E) Deportable prisoners ineligible to apply time credits.--**

11 **(i) In general.**--A prisoner is ineligible to apply time credits under
12 subparagraph (C) if the prisoner is the subject of a final order of removal
13 under any provision of the immigration laws (as such term is defined in
14 section 101(a)(17) of the Immigration and Nationality Act (8 U.S.C.
15 1101(a)(17))).

16 **(ii) Proceedings.**--The Attorney General, in consultation with the Secretary of
17 Homeland Security, shall ensure that any alien described in section 212 or 237
18 of the Immigration and Nationality Act (8 U.S.C. 1182, 1227) who seeks to
19 earn time credits are subject to proceedings described in section 238(a) of that
20 Act (8 U.S.C. 1228(a)) at a date as early as practicable during the prisoner’s
21 incarceration.

22 18 U.S.C. § 3632(d)(4)(E).

23 On November 18, 2022, the BOP issued Program Statement 5410.01, *First Step Act of*
24 *2018 - Time Credits: Procedures for Implementation of 18 U.S.C. 3632(d)(4)*, which precluded
25 prisoners with immigration detainees from applying earned time credits. On February 6, 2023,
26 the BOP issued Change Notice 5410.01 CN-1. Fed. Bureau of Prisons, Change Notice No.
27 541001 CN-1 (Feb. 6, 2023), https://www.bop.gov/policy/progstat/5410.01_cn2.pdf (last visited
28 Sept. 26, 2024).³ “As a result of Change Notice 5410.01, federal prisoners subject to immigration
detainers are no longer automatically prohibited from applying their earned time credits.”

29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
5510
5511
5512
5513
5514
5515
5516
5517
5518
5519
5520
5521
5522
5523
5524
5525
5526
5527
5528
5529
5530
5531
5532
5533
5534
5535
5536
5537
5538
5539
5540
5541
5542
5543
5544
5545
5546
5547
5548
5549
55410
55411
55412
55413
55414
55415
55416
55417
55418
55419
55420
55421
55422
55423
55424
55425
55426
55427
55428
55429
55430
55431
55432
55433
55434
55435
55436
55437
55438
55439
55440
55441
55442
55443
55444
55445
55446
55447
55448
55449
55450
55451
55452
55453
55454
55455
55456
55457
55458
55459
55460
55461
55462
55463
55464
55465
55466
55467
55468
55469
55470
55471
55472
55473
55474
55475
55476
55477
55478
55479
55480
55481
55482
55483
55484
55485
55486
55487
55488
55489
55490
55491
55492
55493
55494
55495
55496
55497
55498
55499
554100
554101
554102
554103
554104
554105
554106
554107
554108
554109
554110
554111
554112
554113
554114
554115
554116
554117
554118
554119
554120
554121
554122
554123
554124
554125
554126
554127
554128
554129
554130
554131
554132
554133
554134
554135
554136
554137
554138
554139
554140
554141
554142
554143
554144
554145
554146
554147
554148
554149
554150
554151
554152
554153
554154
554155
554156
554157
554158
554159
554160
554161
554162
554163
554164
554165
554166
554167
554168
554169
554170
554171
554172
554173
554174
554175
554176
554177
554178
554179
554180
554181
554182
554183
554184
554185
554186
554187
554188
554189
554190
554191
554192
554193
554194
554195
554196
554197
554198
554199
554200
554201
554202
554203
554204
554205
554206
554207
554208
554209
554210
554211
554212
554213
554214
554215
554216
554217
554218
554219
554220
554221
554222
554223
554224
554225
554226
554227
554228
554229
554230
554231
554232
554233
554234
554235
554236
554237
554238
554239
554240
554241
554242
554243
554244
554245
554246
554247
554248
554249
554250
554251
554252
554253
554254
554255
554256
554257
554258
554259
554260
554261
554262
554263
554264
554265
554266
554267
554268
554269
554270
554271
554272
554273
554274
554275
554276
554277
554278
554279
554280
554281
554282
554283
554284
554285
554286
554287
554288
554289
554290
554291
554292
554293
554294
554295
554296
554297
554298
554299
554300
554301
554302
554303
554304
554305
554306
554307
554308
554309
554310
554311
554312
554313
554314
554315
554316
554317
554318
554319
554320
554321
554322
554323
554324
554325
554326
554327
554328
554329
554330
554331
554332
554333
554334
554335
554336
554337
554338
554339
5543310
5543311
5543312
5543313
5543314
5543315
5543316
5543317
5543318
5543319
55433110
55433111
55433112
55433113
55433114
55433115
55433116
55433117
55433118
55433119
554331110
554331111
554331112
554331113
554331114
554331115
554331116
554331117
554331118
554331119
5543311110
5543311111
5543311112
5543311113
5543311114
5543311115
5543311116
5543311117
5543311118
5543311119
55433111110
55433111111
55433111112
55433111113
55433111114
55433111115
55433111116
55433111117
55433111118
55433111119
554331111110
554331111111
554331111112
554331111113
554331111114
554331111115
554331111116
554331111117
554331111118
554331111119
5543311111110
5543311111111
5543311111112
5543311111113
5543311111114
5543311111115
5543311111116
5543311111117
5543311111118
5543311111119
55433111111110
55433111111111
55433111111112
55433111111113
55433111111114
55433111111115
55433111111116
55433111111117
55433111111118
55433111111119
554331111111110
554331111111111
554331111111112
554331111111113
554331111111114
554331111111115
554331111111116
554331111111117
554331111111118
554331111111119
5543311111111110
5543311111111111
5543311111111112
5543311111111113
5543311111111114
5543311111111115
5543311111111116
5543311111111117
5543311111111118
5543311111111119
55433111111111110
55433111111111111
55433111111111112
55433111111111113
55433111111111114
55433111111111115
55433111111111116
55433111111111117
55433111111111118
55433111111111119
554331111111111110
554331111111111111
554331111111111112
554331111111111113
554331111111111114
554331111111111115
554331111111111116
554331111111111117
554331111111111118
554331111111111119
5543311111111111110
5543311111111111111
5543311111111111112
5543311111111111113
5543311111111111114
5543311111111111115
5543311111111111116
5543311111111111117
5543311111111111118
5543311111111111119
55433111111111111110
55433111111111111111
55433111111111111112
55433111111111111113
55433111111111111114
55433111111111111115
55433111111111111116
55433111111111111117
55433111111111111118
55433111111111111119
554331111111111111110
554331111111111111111
554331111111111111112
554331111111111111113
554331111111111111114
554331111111111111115
554331111111111111116
554331111111111111117
554331111111111111118
554331111111111111119
5543311111111111111110
5543311111111111111111
5543311111111111111112
5543311111111111111113
5543311111111111111114
5543311111111111111115
5543311111111111111116
5543311111111111111117
5543311111111111111118
5543311111111111111119
55433111111111111111110
55433111111111111111111
55433111111111111111112
55433111111111111111113
55433111111111111111114
55433111111111111111115
55433111111111111111116
55433111111111111111117
55433111111111111111118
55433111111111111111119
554331111111111111111110
554331111111111111111111
554331111111111111111112
554331111111111111111113
554331111111111111111114
554331111111111111111115
554331111111111111111116
554331111111111111111117
554331111111111111111118
554331111111111111111119
5543311111111111111111110
5543311111111111111111111
5543311111111111111111112
5543311111111111111111113
5543311111111111111111114
5543311111111111111111115
5543311111111111111111116
5543311111111111111111117
5543311111111111111111118
5543311111111111111111119
55433111111111111111111110
55433111111111111111111111
55433111111111111111111112
55433111111111111111111113
55433111111111111111111114
55433111111111111111111115
55433111111111111111111116
55433111111111111111111117
55433111111111111111111118
55433111111111111111111119
554331111111111111111111110
554331111111111111111111111
554331111111111111111111112
554331111111111111111111113
554331111111111111111111114
554331111111111111111111115
554331111111111111111111116
554331111111111111111111117
554331111111111111111111118
554331111111111111111111119
5543311111111111111111111110
5543311111111111111111111111
5543311111111111111111111112
5543311111111111111111111113
5543311111111111111111111114
5543311111111111111111111115
5543311111111111111111111116
5543311111111111111111111117
5543311111111111111111111118
5543311111111111111111111119
55433111111111111111111111110
55433111111111111111111111111
55433111111111111111111111112
55433111111111111111111111113
55433111111111111111111111114
55433111111111111111111111115
55433111111111111111111111116
55433111111111111111111111117
55433111111111111111111111118
55433111111111111111111111119
554331111111111111111111111110
554331111111111111111111111111
554331111111111111111111111112
554331111111111111111111111113
554331111111111111111111111114
554331111111111111111111111115
554331111111111111111111111116
554331111111111111111111111117
554331111111111111111111111118
554331111111111111111111111119
554331111111111111111

1 Alatorre v. Derr, No. CV 22-00516 JMS-WRP, 2023 WL 2599546, at *5 (D. Haw. Mar. 22,
2 2023).

3 **B. Jurisdiction**

4 Respondent asserts that there is “no statutory authority under § 2241 to compel BOP’s
5 FSA ETC discretionary (sentence end-phase programming) action via declaratory and advisory
6 opinions.” (ECF No. 17 at 3.) Respondent argues that “FSA ETC discretionary actions, which
7 involve, among other things, agency inmate evaluations and assessment of available resources,
8 are entrusted by law — such as inmate specific, individualized, FSA ETC earning via EBRR and
9 PA programming — to BOP discretionary action.” (Id.)

10 “Although a district court has no jurisdiction over discretionary designation decisions, it
11 does have jurisdiction to decide whether the Bureau of Prisons acted contrary to established
12 federal law, violated the Constitution, or *exceeded its statutory authority* when it acted pursuant
13 to 18 U.S.C. § 3621.” Rodriguez v. Copenhaver, 823 F.3d 1238, 1242 (9th Cir. 2016) (emphasis
14 added) (citing Close v. Thomas, 653 F.3d 970, 973–74 (9th Cir. 2011)). As set forth above,
15 under 18 U.S.C. § 3632(d)(4)(C), “[t]ime credits earned . . . by prisoners who participate in
16 recidivism reduction programs or productive activities *shall* be applied toward time in prerelease
17 custody or supervised release” and the Director of the BOP “*shall* transfer eligible prisoners, as
18 determined under section 3624(g), into prerelease custody or supervised release.” 18 U.S.C.
19 § 3632(d)(4)(C) (emphasis added). “The BOP is therefore required to apply time credits to
20 eligible prisoners who have earned them and cannot categorically make prisoners ineligible for
21 such credits in a manner that contravenes the statutory scheme set forth in 18 U.S.C. § 3632.”
22 Sierra v. Jacquez, No. 2:22-cv-01509-RSL-BAT, 2022 WL 18046701, at *4 (W.D. Wash. Dec.
23 27, 2022), report and recommendation adopted, 2023 WL 184225 (W.D. Wash. Jan. 13, 2023).
24 Accordingly, the Court finds that dismissal is not warranted on the ground that it lacks
25 jurisdiction to compel BOP discretionary action regarding FTCs because application of FTCs to
26 eligible prisoners who have earned them is *required*, not discretionary, under the statute.

27 ///

28 ///

1 **C. Whether Petitioner is the Subject of a Final Order of Removal**

2 A prisoner is ineligible to apply FTCs “if the prisoner is the subject of a final order of
3 removal under any provision of the immigration laws (as such term is defined in section
4 101(a)(17) of the Immigration and Nationality Act (8 U.S.C. 1101(a)(17))).” 18 U.S.C.
5 § 3632(d)(4)(E)(i). Here, Respondent argues that Petitioner is ineligible to apply FTCs because
6 he is subject to a final order of removal. (ECF No. 17 at 3.) Respondent has filed a copy of an
7 order by an immigration judge denying Petitioner’s application for voluntary departure and
8 ordering Petitioner removed. (ECF No. 23.)

9 The Court notes that the final order of removal issued against Petitioner is dated May 10,
10 2010, more than fourteen years ago. “When an alien subject to removal leaves the country, the
11 removal order is deemed to be executed. If the alien reenters the country illegally, the order may
12 not be executed against him unless it has been ‘reinstated’ by an authorized official.” Morales-
13 Izquierdo v. Gonzales, 486 F.3d 484, 487 (9th Cir. 2007). The Ninth Circuit has “stressed that
14 reinstatement is not ‘automatic’ and instead requires the government to follow certain procedures
15 to obtain a reinstated removal order.” Lopez, 40 F.4th at 1001 (citing Alcala, 563 F.3d at 1013,
16 and Galindo-Romero v. Holder, 640 F.3d 873, 879–80 (9th Cir. 2011)). There is nothing in the
17 record before this Court establishing that the government has fulfilled the requirements to secure
18 reinstatement of Petitioner’s 2010 final order of removal.

19 However, whether the government has fulfilled the requirements to secure reinstatement
20 of Petitioner’s 2010 removal order and whether said removal order may be executed against
21 Petitioner are distinct questions from whether Petitioner “is the subject of a final order of
22 removal under any provision of the immigration laws” under the statute. 18 U.S.C.
23 § 3632(d)(4)(E)(i). Here, the record reflects that a final order of removal exists and Petitioner is
24 the subject of said order. Accordingly, the Court finds that Petitioner is “the subject of a final
25 order of removal under any provision of the immigration laws” for purposes of 18 U.S.C.
26 § 3632(d)(4)(E)(i), and thus, is ineligible to apply First Step Act time credits. See Cuevas v.
27 Birkholz, No. 2:23-cv-07287-GW-JC, 2024 WL 2702918, at *2 (C.D. Cal. Mar. 29, 2024)
28 (“Here, Petitioner is subject to a final removal order . . . requiring his removal to Mexico. He is

1 therefore statutorily ineligible for the application of time credits under the First Step Act[.]”),
2 report and recommendation adopted, 2024 WL 2702652 (C.D. Cal. May 22, 2024). As Petitioner
3 cannot obtain the relief he seeks in the petition, Respondent’s motion to dismiss should be
4 granted.

5 **III.**

6 **RECOMMENDATION**

7 Based on the foregoing, the Court HEREBY RECOMMENDS that:

8 1. Respondent’s motion to dismiss (ECF No. 17) be GRANTED; and
9 2. The petition for writ of habeas corpus be DISMISSED.

10 This Findings and Recommendation is submitted to the assigned United States District
11 Court Judge, pursuant to the provisions of 28 U.S.C. § 636 (b)(1)(B) and Rule 304 of the Local
12 Rules of Practice for the United States District Court, Eastern District of California. Within
13 **THIRTY (30) days** after service of the Findings and Recommendation, any party may file
14 written objections with the court and serve a copy on all parties. Such a document should be
15 captioned “Objections to Magistrate Judge’s Findings and Recommendation.” Replies to the
16 objections shall be served and filed within fourteen (14) days after service of the objections. The
17 assigned United States District Court Judge will then review the Magistrate Judge’s ruling
18 pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1)(C). The parties are advised that failure to file objections within
19 the specified time may waive the right to appeal the District Court’s order. Wilkerson v.
20 Wheeler, 772 F.3d 834, 839 (9th Cir. 2014) (citing Baxter v. Sullivan, 923 F.2d 1391, 1394 (9th
21 Cir. 1991)).

22 IT IS SO ORDERED.
23

24 Dated: September 30, 2024



25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE